

Highgrove House, St Thomas Street, Winchester

14/02772/FUL



Winchester
City Council



© Crown copyright and database rights
Winchester City Council license 100019531

Scale: 0 10 20 40 Meters

Organisation	Winchester City Council
Department	Winchester GIS
Comments	
Date	18/02/2015
MSA Number	100019531

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

Item No: 3
Case No: 14/02772/FUL / W23146/03
Proposal Description: (HOUSEHOLDER) Erection of single storey orangery to rear of property; and garage with studio above to North East of property; alterations to entrance, car parking facilities and associated landscaping (AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING) (RESUBMISSION)
Address: Highgrove House St Thomas Street Winchester Hampshire SO23 9HE
Parish, or Ward if within Winchester City: St Michael
Applicants Name: Mr Joe Cooper
Case Officer: Michelle Thomson
Date Valid: 28 November 2014
Site Factors: Winchester Conservation Area
Civil Aviation
Recommendation: Application Permitted

General Comments

This application is reported to Committee because of the number of objections received.

There is also an associated listed building application which is currently under consideration (Reference: 14/02773/LIS).

The application is a resubmission of an application which was withdrawn on officer advice in November 2014 (References: 14/01987/FUL & 14/01988/LIS). Officer concerns with that application related to the impact of the proposed orangery on the existing trees on site. This issue has been addressed to the satisfaction of officers following the reduction in size of the orangery by approximately 1m.

Since the application was submitted amended plans have been received, which have removed the proposed wood burning stove and associated chimney from the orangery in response to the concerns raised by the Environmental Protection team.

Site Description

13 St Thomas Street or Highgrove House, as it is also known, is a grade II listed building situated on the eastern side of the street in the Winchester Conservation Area. The property is an imposing building comprising a three storey element and a two storey wing. Both of these elements are constructed in red brick with a slate covered roof.

The site has a substantial garden with off street parking and a number of existing outbuildings which are contained behind a tall red brick boundary wall, which is also grade II listed. At present there is a pedestrian street door adjacent to the house and wider vehicular gates towards the northern end, which form access points within the boundary wall. There is a fall in level across the garden from west to east with lawns, planting and mature trees.

Together with 12 St Thomas Street (to the north) and Carlisle House (to the west) the site is representative of the large housing plots constructed within this area of the City during the

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

18th Century. Running parallel to St Thomas Street, to the east, lies Symonds Street, which includes the larger properties of Upper House and Symonds House. Whilst to the south of the site are the smaller terraced properties running up to St Swithun Street and to the West, the more recent developments of Lions Hall and Villiers Court.

Proposal

The proposed development comprises of three main parts, namely:

1. A single storey rear extension to form an orangery;
2. A detached garage with ancillary studio accommodation above to replace an existing outbuilding and;
3. A new lean-to entrance to replace an existing extension with the current pedestrian access gate being infilled and relocated further along the wall.

Some small scale landscaping works are also proposed, including block paving, grass and shrub planting and the re-modelling of the existing steps to the garden.

Relevant Planning History

81/00800/OLD - Conversion of stable block to dwelling, refurbishment of existing house and construction of new access. PER 27th April 1981.

81/00801/OLD - Conversion of stable block to dwelling, refurbishment of existing house and construction of new access. PER 8th April 1981.

82/00720/OLD - Erection of carport and store. PER 18th August 1982.

83/00704/OLD - Conversion of first floor stable block to granny flat. PER 27th April 1983.

95/00594/OLD - Partial change of use from residential to mixed business/residential use. PER 9th November 1995.

99/02218/FUL - (AMENDED DESCRIPTION) Partial change of use from mixed residential and office use to mixed use for residential, office and healthcare uses. PER 18th January 2000.

05/01129/FUL - Shed, greenhouse and external stairway. PER 11th July 2005.

14/01987/FUL - (HOUSEHOLDER) Erection of orangery and garage with annex accommodation at first floor level, alterations to entrance and landscaping (AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING) (AMENDED DESCRIPTION). WDN 26th November 2014.

14/01988/LIS - Erection of orangery and garage with annex accommodation at first floor level, alterations to entrance and landscaping (AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING) (AMENDED DESCRIPTION). WDN 26th November 2014.

14/02773/LIS - Erection of single storey orangery to rear of property and garage with studio above to North East of property; alterations to entrance, car parking facilities and associated landscaping (RESUBMISSION). Pending Consideration.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

Consultations

Engineers: Highways: No objection.

Head of Environmental Protection: 'The termination height and location of this flue is likely to cause unacceptable smoke/odour impacts to the adjacent premises.'

Head of Historic Environment: No objection subject to conditions.

Archaeology: No objection subject to conditions.

Trees: No objection subject to conditions.

Representations:

City of Winchester Trust: Object. The proposed orangery will result in the removal of an attractive canopy and is considered too fussy. The garage is 2 storeys in height and likely to be visible from adjoining buildings.

11 letters received objecting to the application (7 of which also related to the associated listed building application, reference: 14/02773/LIS) for the following reasons:

- Impact of garage and studio accommodation on the amenities of neighbouring properties.
- Design and appearance of the garage resulting in an intrusion into the streetscene.
- Adverse impact of garage on the conservation area and the built and natural environment.
- Overdevelopment of the site.
- Garage not subordinate to the existing house.
- No established need for new living accommodation at 13 St Thomas Street.
- Previous proposals at other sites have restricted the use of garages for ancillary uses only.
- Additional noise and traffic from studio accommodation.
- Loss of openness on St Thomas Street.
- Detrimental loss of boundary wall.
- Impact of additional waste water and sewage on existing network.
- Height of orangery chimney and impact of resulting fumes.

Reasons aside not material to planning and therefore not addressed in this report

- Loss of views.
- Motivations of the applicant.
- Previous planting on site.
- Previous damage to the property.

Relevant Planning Policy:

Winchester District Local Plan Review
DP3, DP4, HE1, HE4, HE5, HE14, H3, T4
Winchester Local Plan Part 1 – Joint Core Strategy
DS1, WT1, CP13, CP20
National Planning Policy Guidance/Statements:

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

National Planning Policy Framework
Supplementary Planning Guidance
Winchester Conservation Area Project
Other Planning guidance
Winchester City and its Setting

Planning Considerations

Principle of development

The site is located within the development boundary of Winchester where the principle of new residential development and extensions to existing residential properties are considered to be acceptable subject to the proposal conforming to the criteria set out in Policy DP3 of WDLPR.

As the dwelling is a grade II Listed Building located within the Winchester Conservation Area consideration must also be given to the impact of the development on the listed building and the conservation area in accordance with policies HE4, HE5 and HE14 of Winchester District Local Plan Review 2006 and policy CP20 of Winchester Local Plan Part 1 – Joint Core Strategy.

Design/layout

The proposed orangery would be constructed to the rear of the southern portion of the property, which is in itself a later addition and has been subject to alteration. The single storey extension would have a low brick plinth, above which the walls would be framed in timber, of classical proportions with wide corner pilasters and narrow pilasters between the full-height windows. The external walls would be surmounted by a heavy cornice, with a large, glazed lantern forming the larger part of the roof. Wide entrance doors to the extension would form part of its north elevation, whereas the corresponding south elevation would consist of blank brickwork. The eastern end of the orangery has a shallow bow form, reflecting the similar shallow bow at the north end of the east elevation of the house.

The replacement lean to extension on the north elevation of the house would have a pent roof, a central door with a fanlight above, a flat bracketed canopy and two small windows on either side of the door.

In the north east corner of the rear garden a freestanding double garage is proposed with ancillary studio accommodation above. The garage would be constructed of brickwork, with a hipped, pitched and flat roof and two hipped dormer windows on the west elevation. The roof of the garage would be covered in slate with the flat element being lead, whilst the garage doors and windows would be constructed of timber.

The existing pedestrian gate opening in the boundary wall with St Thomas Street would be relocated as part of the proposals in order to accommodate the replacement lean to extension on the northern elevation of the building. The existing opening would be infilled with matching brickwork (recessed by 100mm) and a new opening made beneath a new brick arch.

Impact on character of area and neighbouring property

With regards to the proposed orangery the overall size, scale and design of the structure is considered to be appropriate and would be sympathetic to the existing building. As

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

noted this part of the building is both later and simpler in its form than the larger part of the house and has been subject to a greater number of alterations. In this context the proposed extension is not considered to have an adverse impact on the listed building. Furthermore, given its position at the rear of the property the addition would not be visible from the streetscene and would not be detrimental to the overall character of the conservation area.

Whilst the orangery would incorporate a large amount of glazing, both in terms of the rear and side elevations and the roof, the side elevation adjacent to number 14 St Thomas Street would be formed of solid brickwork, thereby ensuring that there would be no unacceptable overlooking or loss of privacy to the neighbouring property.

It is acknowledged that the boundary wall between Highgrove House and 14 St Thomas Street varies considerably in height and that as a result of this and the overall scale of the extension there would be some views of the orangery from the neighbouring property. However, a gap of approximately 1.83m to 2.44m would be retained between the addition and the boundary wall as the extension would follow the existing building line. When taking this into consideration alongside the overall size and scale of the extension, the existing boundary treatment and the existing structures in the rear garden of number 14 St Thomas Street then the proposal would not be overbearing or have a detrimental impact on the outlook of this neighbouring property.

The Environmental Protection team had raised concerns regarding the position and termination height of the proposed chimney, which was to serve the wood burning stove proposed in the orangery. However, following discussions with the applicant this element has been removed from the application and as such this issue has been satisfactorily addressed.

On the northern elevation of the house a new lean to extension is proposed to provide a new entrance hall for the building. This would replace an existing extension and whilst it would be larger than the current structure its design is considered to be acceptable and subservient to the overall scale of the property. Given its size and scale the addition would not be visible from the streetscene as a result of the existing boundary wall which would also ensure that it would not have any adverse impact on any neighbouring residents amenity.

The proposed garage structure with ancillary accommodation would be of a significant size both in terms of its overall footprint and height, however, whilst substantial this building would be proportionate to the dwellinghouse and the site within which it is situated. Highgrove House is an example of a large historic property with a proportionate amount of open space associated with it, which contributes to the overall setting of the building. Similar examples can be found within the wider conservation area, including Well House and number 12 St Thomas Street.

Historically the existence of substantial outbuildings associated with these large properties is entirely consistent with the traditional arrangements of such historic houses and both Highgrove House and 12 St Thomas Street previously had an old coach house, which have both since been converted into separate residential uses. Within this context, the proposed detached double garage would be entirely in keeping with the size of plot and the size of house with which it is associated.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

With regards to its positioning, the existing garden at Highgrove House does to a large extent provide the setting for the listed building. However, this northern part of the site contains an existing modern outbuilding and a parking area. The contribution of this area to the setting of the listed building is therefore, far more limited than the rest of the garden, which is formed of lawn with traditional flowerbeds and a large copper beech tree. As such the garage would be positioned so as to avoid crowding the listed building and would respect its immediate setting.

It is acknowledged that from the surrounding area it may be possible to glimpse the proposed garage from the streetscene, however, the existing boundary wall and vegetation on site would severely restrict these views as would the change in levels across the plot. The garage itself has a traditional and simplistic form and would utilise brickwork and slate, which would replicate the materials used in the existing property. It would therefore, form a sympathetic addition to the existing site.

Furthermore, within this urban context, where buildings are, on the whole, located on tightly constrained sites in close proximity to one another, glimpses of a number of existing structures, including modern buildings are available throughout the conservation area. A considerable distance of approximately 15m would be retained between the garage and the rear of Upper House, which is the listed building to the rear of the site and as such would not result in any harm to its setting. The proposal is therefore, not considered to result in any additional harm to the character of appearance of the conservation area in this respect.

Although the proposed garage with ancillary accommodation would be visible from several neighbouring properties and would result in a clear alteration in the appearance of the site, the loss of a view from these properties would not in itself be a material consideration in planning terms.

As set out above the overall size, scale and design of the proposed garage is considered to be acceptable and not detrimental to the overall character or appearance of the conservation area. Whilst two dormer windows would be incorporated into the front elevation of the garage facing towards St Thomas Street, given the change in levels on the site itself and the distance between the proposed garage and the neighbouring properties (24.47m to Villiers Court & 32.54m to Lions Hall) it is not considered that the structure would be overbearing or result in any unacceptable loss of privacy or overlooking. As such the proposed garage structure would not result in any detrimental impacts to neighbouring residents amenities.

The proposed alterations to the existing pedestrian access and boundary wall with St Thomas Street are considered to be acceptable. It is apparent that the boundary wall has been subject to numerous alterations and by incorporating a 100mm recess to the brickwork when infilling the existing opening then evidence of its previous position will be retained. The proposed access will have a similar impact on the streetscene to the existing pedestrian entranceway, albeit with a small re-location. As such there would be no detrimental impact to the overall character or appearance of the conservation area. The works would also have no adverse impact on any neighbouring residents' amenity.

The removal of the existing steps leading down to the garden and their replacement with a new central set of steps with a brick wall on either side in conjunction with the proposed brick paving and landscaping measures would not have any adverse impact to the setting

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

of the listed building or the conservation area. These works are minor in nature and would retain the substantial traditional garden associated with the property.

On balance, it is therefore, not considered that any of the elements of the proposed development would have an unacceptably adverse impact on the listed building or the wall, nor on the character of the conservation area or on neighbouring residents' amenities. To ensure that the works have a satisfactory visual appearance a condition is recommended which would require a sample panel of proposed materials to be erected on site and approved by officers. Additional conditions in respect of the listed building are recommended under the associated listed building application (Reference: 14/02773/LIS).

Landscape/Trees

Following discussions between the applicant and the tree officers the depth of the orangery has been reduced by approximately 1m as part of this submission in order to overcome previous concerns raised with regards to the earlier applications (References: 14/01987/FUL & 14/01988/LIS).

The tree officers are satisfied that the information submitted demonstrates that the proposed development would not have an unacceptably adverse impact on the existing tree specimens and the works are therefore considered to be acceptable subject to appropriate conditions.

Highways/Parking

The application site lies within the town centre boundary of Winchester in a highly accessible location. The existing vehicular access to the site would remain unaltered as a result of the proposed development. Having assessed the proposals the Highways Engineers have confirmed that they do not contain any significant highway issues and are unlikely to have any impact on highway safety.

Other Matters

Whilst there is no detailed information on archaeological remains within the site itself, it is expected that the site will contain deeply stratified and potentially well preserved archaeological remains, which may be considered to be of national importance. As such there is potential for the proposals to have an adverse affect on potentially significant archaeological remains.

With regards to the proposed lean-to entrance extension this would be situated in an area, which has previously been disturbed by existing services and foundations, which when taken into consideration with the overall size of the structure, suggests that any new ground impact is likely to be fairly limited and unlikely to have a significant archaeological impact.

The proposed orangery and garage structure will have a greater impact on the ground, particularly in respect of the garage where a larger amount of ground reduction is proposed and could therefore, have a high potential to adversely affect significant archaeological remains. However, it is considered that with suitable conditions a carefully designed foundation strategy could be formulated and the proper treatment of buried archaeological remains, including their conservation through preservation in situ (where appropriate and feasible) could be ensured.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

Recommendation

Application Permitted subject to the following condition(s):

Conditions

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
1. Reason: To comply with the provisions of Section 91 (1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended).
2. The ancillary studio accommodation hereby approved shall be used as ancillary accommodation for the main dwelling, Highgrove House (13 St Thomas Street) only and shall not be used as a separate dwelling unit.
2. Reason: To preserve the amenities of the local area.
3. No development/demolition or site preparation shall take place until the applicant or their agents or successors in title has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological mitigation work (to include a first phase of archaeological evaluation work) in accordance with a Written Scheme of Investigation that has been submitted to and approved by the local planning authority in writing. No demolition/development or site preparation shall take place other than in accordance with the Written Scheme of Investigation approved by the LPA. The Written Scheme of Investigation shall include:
 1. The programme and methodology of site investigation and recording
 2. Provision for post investigation assessment, reporting and dissemination
 3. Provision to be made for deposition of the analysis and records of the site investigation (archive)
 4. Nomination of a competent person or persons/organisation to undertake the works set out within the Written Scheme of Investigation.
3. Reason: To mitigate the effect of the development upon any heritage assets and to ensure that information regarding these heritage assets is preserved by record for future generations, in compliance with policy HE.1 of the Winchester District Local Plan Review.
4. Following completion of archaeological fieldwork a report will be produced in accordance with an approved programme including where appropriate post-excavation assessment, specialist analysis and reports and publication.
4. Reason: To ensure that evidence from the historic environment contributing to our knowledge and understanding of our past is captured and made publicly available, in compliance with policy HE.1 of the Winchester District Local Plan Review.
5. Before any works hereby permitted are begun, details of the foundations, piling configuration, drainage and services, to include a detailed design and method statement, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, such details to show the preservation of surviving archaeological remains which are to be preserved.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

5. Reason: To ensure the conservation and protection of important archaeological remains present within the site, in compliance with policy HE.1 of the Winchester District Local Plan Review.
6. Sample panels of all new facing brickwork showing the proposed brick types, colour, texture, face bond and pointing shall be provided on site and the specification approved in writing by the LPA before the relevant parts of the works are begun. The relevant parts of the work shall be carried out in accordance with such approved sample panels. The approved sample panels shall be retained on site until the work is completed.
6. Reason: To ensure that the detailing and finish maintains the architectural character and appearance of the listed building.
7. All works prescribed – both to trees and that related to demolition and construction activities shall be undertaken in strict accordance with the Arboricultural Information ref: HBD1427MSL1 written by Helen Brown of Alderwood Consulting Limited and submitted to the Local Planning Authority.
7. Reason for above condition: to ensure protection and long term viability of retained trees and to minimise impact of construction activity.
8. Protective measures, including fencing and ground protection, in accordance with the Arboricultural Information ref: HBD1427MSL1 written by Helen Brown of Alderwood Consulting Limited and submitted to the Local Planning Authority shall be installed prior to any demolition, construction or groundwork commencing on the site and will remain until the development is complete.
8. Reason for above condition: to ensure protection and long term viability of retained trees and to minimise impact of construction activity.

Informatives:

1. In accordance with paragraphs 186 and 187 of the NPPF Winchester City Council (WCC) take a positive and proactive approach to development proposals focused on solutions. WCC work with applicants/agents in a positive and proactive manner by;

- offering a pre-application advice service and,
- updating applicants/agents of any issues that may arise in the processing of their application and where possible suggesting solutions.
- In this instance the applicant was updated of any issues after the initial site visit.

2. This permission is granted for the following reasons:
The development is in accordance with the Policies and Proposals of the Development Plan set out below, and other material considerations do not have sufficient weight to justify a refusal of the application. In accordance with Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004, planning permission should therefore be granted.

3. The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

Winchester District Local Plan Review 2006: DP3, DP4, HE1, HE4, HE5, HE14, H3, T4
Winchester District Local Plan Part 1: DS1, WT1, CP13, CP20

4. All building works including demolition, construction and machinery or plant operation should only be carried out between the hours of 0800 and 1800 hrs Monday to Friday and 0800 and 1300 hrs Saturday and at no time on Sundays or recognised public holidays. Where allegations of noise from such works are substantiated by the Environmental Protection Team, a Notice limiting the hours of operation under The Control of Pollution Act 1974 may be served.
5. During Construction, no materials should be burnt on site. Where allegations of statutory nuisance are substantiated by the Environmental Protection Team, an Abatement Notice may be served under The Environmental Protection Act 1990. The applicant is reminded that the emission of dark smoke through the burning of materials is a direct offence under The Clean Air Act 1993.
6. The applicant is advised that this consent must be implemented in conjunction with the accompanying listed building application (Reference: 14/02773/LIS) and any conditions attached to it.
7. It is recommended that the Tree Officer is informed once protective measures have been installed so that they can be inspected and deemed appropriate. Evidence will also be required to demonstrate that the protective measures have been installed prior to any demolition, construction or groundwork commences on the site and to show that it has remained until the development is completed before the relevant condition may be discharged.